



Valour Canada

Llandoverly Castle Case Study: Additional Resources

Learning Objectives:

- ✚ Define Canada's role in the FWW and how its experience impacted Canada domestically and internationally during the war as well as in the years following the signing of the armistice.
- ✚ Outline the Geneva and Hague Conventions, explain their purpose, and assess whether they can prevent atrocities.
- ✚ Explain the potential impact of nationalism on perspectives of justice following the FWW.

**VALOUR
CANADA**



**CONNECTING
CANADIANS
TO THEIR MILITARY
HERITAGE**

FREE AND FAIR USE

Dear Teachers, Museum Educators, and other users of Valour Canada material,

Please freely use, share, adapt, and copy, the materials and lesson plans provided by Valour Canada for the purposes of educating and not for monetary gain of any sort. Valour Canada appreciates being credited for the materials it has created and shared and we ask that our logo remains present on our documents; feel free to add your organization's logo alongside ours if preferred. We request that you do not insert images or written content from Valour Canada's materials into other published works.

A small favour: Please Complete a 60-second Survey



By completing our survey, we are informed that you have used Valour Canada's materials. This allows our organization to improve our products, compile statistical data, and demonstrate efficacy to our supporters, all so that we can create new and better programming. Any feedback (suggestions, concerns, ideas, questions, etc.) you are willing to share is thankfully accepted.

To offer feedback, help us build a statistical profile about program use, or contact us, please visit: <https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/YN653S7>

Our most sincere thank you!
- Valour Canada

Llandoverly Castle Case Study: Additional Questions

The following document features extra questions for students who decide to conduct further research about the case of Llandoverly Castle. These questions can be discussed in groups or Think-Pair-Share's, as well as individually. This document also features an additional list of sources related to the sinking of the Llandoverly Castle and the Leipzig Trials.

Questions:

1. What role did Dithmar and Boldt play in the shooting of the lifeboats?
2. Does someone need to be an active participant to be guilty of an atrocity?
3. Who is responsible when an atrocity is committed? Is it the person carrying out an order? Or the person who gave the order?
4. Is it ever appropriate to attack neutral parties in war, like medical personnel and civilians, in order to achieve success?
5. Do the rules of war apply to one party if the other party is breaking them?
6. Can justice ever truly be served if only one party is investigated for crimes?
7. Were Dithmar and Boldt "retailers" or "wholesalers"? "Big fish" or "little fish"? What about Patzig? What about HMHS Llandoverly Castle?
8. Does it matter how important the accused are in society? Why or why not?
9. What does the phrase "might is not right" mean?
10. What was the purpose of the Leipzig Trials? Considering this purpose, was justice served?
11. Based on the articles of the Hague Conventions of 1899 and 1907, which rules did the crew of the German U-86 break in the events of 27 June 1918?
12. How were the Hague Convention's rules of war enforced? How were rule breakers punished?
13. Why is the "chain of command" such an important principle in the military?
14. Is it ever acceptable for a military member to refuse an order from a superior? What should happen in this case?
15. How were enemy militaries expected to treat each other?
16. Had the rules of war been long enough established to expect combatants to respect them?
17. What does the phrase 'fog of war' refer to?
18. Does understanding the 'fog of war' excuse the occurrence of atrocities?
19. If the Germans had won the war, would the atrocities committed have been excusable?
20. Is alleged Allied mistreatment of hospital ships an excuse for Germans to retaliate?

Llandovery Castle Case Study: Additional Resources

- “The ‘Llandovery Castle’ Outrage: Survivor’s Story to the King.” *The Hospital*. July 13, 1918. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5239281/>
- Bassiouni, M. Cherif. “World War I: ‘The War to End All Wars’ and the Birth of a Handicapped International Criminal Justice System.” *Denver Journal of International Law and Policy* 30, no. 3 (2002): 244–91.
- Bergsmo, Morten, Cheah Wui Ling, and Y. I. Ping, eds. *Historical Origins of International Criminal Law: Volume 1*. Brussels: Torkel Opsahl Academic EPublisher, 2014.
- Clausewitz, Carl von. *German War Trials: Judgment in Case of Commander Karl Neumann*. Vol. 16. American Society of International Law, 1922. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2187593>.
- . *On War*. Edited by Michael Howard and Peter Paret. Princeton, N.J: Princeton University Press, 1976.
- Convention on Hospital Ships. The Hague, 21 December 1904. In *International Committee of the Red Cross*. <https://ihl-databases.icrc.org/applic/ihl/ihl.nsf/Treaty.xsp?documentId=5928847AC56B16FDC12563CD002D6728&action=openDocument>.
- Doucet, Jay, Gregory Haley, and Vivian McAlister. “Massacre of Canadian Army Medical Corps Personnel after the Sinking of HMHS Llandovery Castle and the Evolution of Modern War Crime Jurisprudence.” *Canadian Journal of Surgery; Ottawa* 61, no. 3 (June 2018): 155–57. <http://dx.doi.org.ezproxy.lib.ucalgary.ca/10.1503/cjs.006518>.
- Gray, Edwyn A. *The U-Boat War, 1914–1918*. Barnsley: Pen and Sword, 1994.
- Jones, Heather. “Prisoners of War.” in *1914-1918-online. International Encyclopedia of the First World War*, ed. by Ute Daniel, Peter Gatrell, Oliver Janz, Heather Jones, Jennifer Keene, Alan Kramer, and Bill Nasson, 2014. https://encyclopedia.1914-1918-online.net/article/prisoners_of_war)
- . “Prisoners of War.” In *The British Library Online*, 2014, <https://www.bl.uk/world-war-one/articles/prisoners-of-war>.
- Macphail, Andrew. *Official History of the Canadian Forces in the Great War 1914-19: The Medical Services*. Ottawa: F. A. Acland, King’s Printer, 1925. <http://archive.org/details/medicalservices00macpuoft>.
- McWilliams, James, and R. James Steel. *Amiens: Dawn of Victory*. Toronto: Dundurn, 2001.
- Mullins, Claud. *The Leipzig Trials; An Account of the War Criminals’ Trials and a Study of German Mentality*. London: H.F. & G. Witherby, 1921. <http://archive.org/details/leipzigtrialsac00mull>.
- Porter, Ken, and Stephen Wynn. *Castle Point in the Great War*. Barnsley: Pen & Sword, 2015.